Introduction to the Systematic Review – Foundation for Long-term Success in Research and Writing in the Social Sciences

Asst Prof Steven A Martin, PhD
www.StevenAndrewMartin.com
Teaching and Learning
Presentation Outline

- Where to begin?
  - The powerful secret.
- Identifying types of literature.
  - Grey literature.
  - Inclusion and exclusion.
- Annotated bibliographies.
- Organizing files and folders.
- Case example – Surf tourism.
- Case example – Thai geography.
- Conclusion – The silver bullet.
  - Suggestions and opportunities.
  - Relevant resources

www.StevenAndrewMartin.com
How to Develop a Systematic Review

Where and How to Begin?

Choose a topic or area of interest for research and begin to survey the literature, looking for themes, theories, gaps in the knowledge, methods employed, scholars in the field, etc.

Today’s presentation suggests a strategy so powerful that it can carry you to the gates of mastery and publication in your field.

Q: What is this powerful secret?
A systematic literature review is a straightforward methodology often applied in medical research, now used in the social sciences, including tourism studies.

- **A method** – and opportunity – to investigate, master, and present research.
  - Normatively (i.e. standards / reasons / judgements).
  - Qualitatively (i.e. qualities / descriptions).
  - Quantitatively (quantities / outputs / statistics).
- **A documentary analysis** particularly useful to research faculty.
  - Knowledge of research productivity.
  - Facilitates an understanding of scholarly output.  (Jogaratnam et al., 2005)
- **A comprehensive coverage** of a field of study.
  - A primary research activity in its own right.  (Weed, 2006)

www.StevenAndrewMartin.com
Identifying types of Literature

Types of research (published)
- Journals ★
- Books
- Book chapters
- Conference proceedings
- Newspapers of record

Types of research (grey)
- Theses and dissertations
- Commissioned works
- NPG/NGO
- Government reports
- Corporate sector (e.g. economic impact studies)
- Private sector
- Websites
- Videos
- Other electronic sources

Quantity of research
- Pieces of research
- Institutional contributors
- Author contributions and citations
- Infometrics
- Bibliometrics

Research topics
- Themes
- Theories
- Trends
- Typologies
- Methods
- Results
- Recommendations

Presentation of results
- Content analysis
- Narratively / descriptively
- Qualitatively
- Quantitatively
- Research productivity

Outcomes and benefits
- Mastery of the literature and subject
- Knowledge gaps
- Database of authors, files, references
- Trend analysis
- Meta-analysis

www.StevenAndrewMartin.com
Systematic Review

Types of research (grey)
- Theses and dissertations
- Commissioned works
- NPG/NGO
- Government reports
- Corporate sector (e.g. economic impact studies)
- Private sector
- Websites
- Videos
- Other electronic sources

Types of research (published)
- Journals ★
- Books
- Book chapters
- Newspapers of record

Quantity of research
- Pieces of research
- Institutional contributors
- Author contributions and citations
- Infometrics
- Bibliometrics

Research topics
- Themes
- Theories
- Trends
- Typologies
- Statistics
- Methods
- Results
- Recommendations

Presentation of results
- Content analysis
- Qualitatively (e.g. narratively / descriptively / thematically)
- Quantitatively (e.g. statistics)
- Research productivity

Long-term outcomes and benefits
- Mastery of the literature and subject
- Knowledge gaps
- Database of authors, files, references
- Trend analysis
- Meta-analysis

www.StevenAndrewMartin.com
Grey Literature – Shades of Grey (slide 1 of 2)

• Examples
  • Theses and dissertations.
  • Paper presentations (without inclusion in conference proceedings).
  • Commissioned works (e.g. economic impact studies).
  • NPG/NGO reports and field studies.
  • Government reports (e.g. mining sector reports).
  • Corporate sector (e.g. economic impact studies).
  • Public/private sector reports.
  • Websites.
  • Films/Documentaries/Videos/YouTube, etc.
  • Other electronic sources.

• Negatives
  • Accessibility issues.
  • Ephemera (e.g. internet blogs, unpublished posters, PowerPoint files, etc.).
  • Transient (here today, gone tomorrow).

• Positives
  • Unrestricted.
  • Speed of dissemination.
  • Potentially unlimited in scope, detail and length.
Grey Literature – Shades of Grey (slide 2)

• **Deliberately grey literature** (i.e. intended readership only) are potentially significant in terms of flexibility in approach and content.

• **Speed of dissemination** to the private or public domain, the opportunity to go into detail (e.g. not restricted in size or word count).

• A window into **developing fields of research** where traditional academic materials may be limited or unavailable.
  • Examples include **niche tourism** and teaching geography.
Inclusion and Exclusion of Literature

Setting the boundaries – what’s in and what’s out

• Many references found on the internet or quoted in others’ written works do not meet accessibility criteria and are therefore of limited value to future research.

• Avoid ephemera (e.g. internet blogs, unpublished posters, PowerPoint files, etc.).

Developing eligibility criteria

• Name(s) of author(s), venue, dates, and an accountable record of presentation or proceedings for conference papers (including page numbers).

• Name of author, year of completion, university and its location for Bachelor, Honors, Master’s, and PhD theses.

• Name(s) of author(s) or lead organization(s) (accountable for or commissioned by), year, and type of publication for government or not-for-profit publications or reports.

• Name(s) of author(s), year, and volume and page numbers of peer-reviewed journal articles.

• Name(s) of author(s), year, publisher, chapter and/or title, and pages for books.

What’s in or out?
You decide.

For example: “only journal articles published between 2000 and 2020.”
Annotated Bibliography (slide 1 of 3)

- **Write a reference for each file** (each piece of research) according to a given formatting style (such as APA style).
- **Write a synopsis for each reference** (a short summary or “annotation”).

### BOOK CHAPTER


Discusses the exhibition of corporeality as a form and basis of profitable tourist industries, including the case of surfing in Waikiki Hawaii over the last century, where romance and intrigue for the Hawaiian surfer were used as marketing strategy.

### BOOK SECTION


The investigation provides the history and development of tourism in the marine environments and mentions surf tourism as a relevant component of marine tourism, identifying that “Surfing has had a massive influence on the image of marine activities, and forms a world-wide recreational activity participated in by millions.” (ibid). Oram (ibid) notes that surfing extends well beyond the enthusiasm for the activity itself, having far-reaching influences as a result of image, surf clothing, and movies.

### JOURNAL ARTICLE


The research examines the dynamics of surfing in Puerto Rico, finding that the sport provides stewardship and positive ties for the island’s history, economy, and developmental strategies; the study traces the evolution of surf tourism as a positive element within Puerto Rico, exploring the issues of conservation, ecology, territoriality, the dichotomy among surfers and boogie boarders, and the government’s limited attention to the market segment.

### MASTER THESIS


From a sociological perspective, surf travel was portrayed as a lifestyle choice through early surf films and the media. This study looks at the social construction of surfing in the contexts of commodification, gender, mobility, and nature in media depictions of the surfing lifestyle, offering a discourse on the history and meaning of surf travel in the framework of colonization, social resistance, and globalization of the surfing subculture.
Example of annotation with more than one category

• Synopsis
• Contribution
• Methods

• Recommendations
• Suggestions for future research

JOURNAL ARTICLE

Synopsis
Among the earliest research conducted on surf tourism, the research explores the advent of surf-related sports on the French Atlantic, especially the development of surf resorts in the three southernmost provinces, which were attributed principally to an emerging trend in ‘freedom-loving activities’, and where surfing events are a key determinant spawned by the members of surf clubs and the synergies it inspired among the sponsors, the media, and the local communities.

Contribution
The study identifies the early development of surfing in France as a new sport activity recognized and supported in hospitality and tourism and viewed as a sure commercial bet given the driving forces of territorial dynamism, regional self-promotion, and the creation of a new image for coastal resorts. The study distinguishes that surfing events are corollary to the growth phenomena and are driven by surf clubs, corporate sponsors, media linkages, and especially in the case of France, supported by the regional government. Furthermore the research provides insight to four areas of surfing and town planning: 1) the tendency to create new seaside sites with the added impetus of surfing; 2) the surf resort concept; 3) the growth of surf clubs; 4) the significance of undeveloped and difficult to reach sites.

Methods
The methods of the research are not clearly defined or provided. However, the references include those related and previously published by author in French.
According to the Purdue Online Writing Lab (OWL, 2020), "Depending on the purpose of your bibliography, some annotations may summarize, some may assess or evaluate a source, and some may reflect on the source’s possible uses for the project at hand."

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Place &amp; Publisher</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Jennings offers a discussion on fresh water and marine tourism focused on boating, sporting, adventure, and sustainability, offering a market profile on surfing, noting that the sport of surfing pays great attention to public concerns over water quality. Jennings discusses the example of Surfers Against Sewage (SAS), a not-for-profit organization founded by surfers who campaign for clean and safe recreational waters. The study identifies that the organization’s use of media-catching images and proactive arguments based upon published research has brought validity and success to the advocacy for clean water at surfing beaches.

- Note that annotations can be tailored to a given topic or theme in the research relevant to a given project.
- In the example provided here, the annotation if aimed at a single chapter in the book which is dedicated to surf tourism.
Organizing Files and Folders

As pieces of research are located and selected for a given study or topic, **convert and save all files as PDF.**

- Note: dummy files can be made for articles not yet accessible.

**Name each file**

1. main author’s last name.
2. year of publication.
3. short catchy title.

**Examples**

Martin (2012) Systematic Surf Tourism

Martin (2020) Thai Geo for ASEAN Edu

Once the files are placed in a folder, they will be automatically organized in alphabetical order and by year.
## Conceptual Framework for a Research-based Literature Review

### Developing an Annotated Bibliography and Database

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LOCATE &amp; ORGANIZE FILES</th>
<th>DEVELP ANNOTED BIBLIOGRAPHY</th>
<th>IDENTIFY AND BUILD THEMES FOR LITERATURE REVIEW</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Search &amp; locate appropriate research articles</td>
<td><strong>EXAMPLE</strong></td>
<td>- Water Quality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Review articles for content &amp; applicability</td>
<td>Among the earliest research conducted on surf tourism, the study explores the advent of surf-related sports on the French Atlantic, especially the development of surf resorts in the three southernmost provinces, which were attributed principally to an emerging trend in ‘freedom-loving activities’, where surfing events are a key determinant spawned by the members of surf clubs and the synergies inspired among sponsors, the media, and local communities.</td>
<td>- Key locations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rename articles by main authors’ last name, year and an abbreviated title (the article will match an alphabetical reference list)</td>
<td><strong>EXAMPLE</strong></td>
<td>- Characteristics of marine tourists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Create new folders by topic or category</td>
<td><strong>EXAMPLE</strong></td>
<td>- Surf tourism as a new area of marine tourism</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Example

#### Topic – Marine Tourism
- Surf tourism
  - O’Brien (2007) Surf event leveraging
- Dive tourism
  - Howard (2000) Diving tourism in Hawaii
- Cruise tourism
  - Johnson (2000) Atlantic Cruise Industry

**For theses and exhaustive research, an annotated bibliography may be incorporated as an appendix (i.e. it is research in its own right)**

#### Theme – Surf tourism as a new area of marine tourism

In recent years, surf tourism has emerged as a new research area in marine tourism. Martin (2011) identifies that prior to 1995, research in surf tourism was limited, yet today there are over one-hundred pieces of research.
Case Example – Surf Tourism
(slide 1 of 5)

- Quantitative
- Qualitative
- Trend analysis

- Evidence-based informetric approach to the development, content, and current status of surf tourism research in the academe.
- Investigation identifying intellectual linkages which can be systematically counted, such as the growth and productivity of studies.
- Reference list provides a seminal body of documentary research materials on surf tourism (i.e. a ‘corpus’)

The genesis of a new body of sport tourism literature: a systematic review of surf tourism research (1997–2011)
Steven Andrew Martin & Ilian Assenov

Surf tourism is a rapidly expanding market segment of the wider sport tourism industry and the purpose of this study is to provide an analytical interpretation of surf tourism research. Published and unpublished literature from 1997 through to 2011 was collected through searching a variety of academic databases and communicating directly with the authors themselves. A systematic review was employed to identify and analyze the types of research emerging from international journals, universities, governments, and the not-for-profit sector. The study indicates a genesis in sport tourism literature, representing a new and available body of surf tourism research. We find that this new area of research has arisen mainly from the grey literature through the works of graduate students and consultants. Surfing events, artificial surfing reefs, and the sustainability of surf sites and host communities are among the most prolific areas under discussion and key arguments include socioeconomics, coastal management, and sustainable tourism. Approximately 10% of countries in the world with coastal surfing resources have been studied, and this and other findings indicate the potential for new areas of research in domestic and international tourism. A bibliography provides 156 documentary materials compiled for the systematic review.

Keywords: surfing; sport tourism; literature review; sustainability; coastal management

www.StevenAndrewMartin.com
Based on these results, are there research gaps? – Where might we consider conducting research?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Country/region</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Sub-total</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Global</td>
<td>General</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>East and South</td>
<td>27</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>West</td>
<td>8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Australia</td>
<td>General</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>California</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hawaii</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Florida</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Puerto Rico</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Zealand</td>
<td>General</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>USA</td>
<td>Mentawai</td>
<td>17</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bali</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lombok</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indonesia</td>
<td>General</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mentawai</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bali</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lombok</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Europe</td>
<td>UK</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Spain</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>France</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Ireland</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Portugal</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Oceania</td>
<td>General</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Fiji</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Samoa</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Papua New Guinea</td>
<td>3</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Africa</td>
<td>South Africa</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Morocco</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latin America</td>
<td>Costa Rica</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Mexico</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Chile</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>El Salvador</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Others</td>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Maldives</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Based on these results, where might we consider submitting our research for publication?

Table 2. Research articles by journal

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Journal</th>
<th>Articles&lt;sup&gt;a&lt;/sup&gt;</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Journal of Coastal Research</td>
<td>5(2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal of Sport &amp; Tourism&lt;sup&gt;b&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
<td>3(3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reef Journal</td>
<td>3(0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal of Sustainable Tourism; Shore &amp; Beach</td>
<td>2(2)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism Management</td>
<td>2(0)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Africa Insight; European Sport Management Quarterly; Geografiska Annaler; Geographical Review; International Journal of the History of Sport; Journal of Ecotourism; Journal of Quality Assurance in Hospitality &amp; Tourism; Land Use Policy; Society &amp; Leisure; South African Journal for Research in Sport, Physical Education and Recreation; Tourism Analysis; Tourism Planning and Development; Tourism in Marine Environments; Tourism Review International Annals of Tourism Research; Cultural Values; Event Management; Film &amp; History; Geography Compass; Journal of Travel Research; Managing Service Quality; Qualitative Market Research – An International Journal; Revista de Turismo y Patrimonio Cultural; Sport in History; Tourism Geographies</td>
<td>1(1)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total journal articles</td>
<td>42(23)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<sup>a</sup>Articles which are dedicated to surf tourism are in parenthesis.

<sup>b</sup>Previously (until 2006) known as Journal of Sport Tourism.
Based on these results, who might we contact for a personal interview?

Table 4. Shortlist of prolific authorship in surf tourism

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Citations (Google Scholar)</th>
<th>Total dedicated articles</th>
<th>Other research</th>
<th>Total pieces of research</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Buckley</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lazarow</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ponting</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dolnicar</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>O’Brien</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nelsen</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Arranged by number of Google Scholar citations.

*As of 5 September 2012.

*Includes non-dedicated surf tourism articles in journals, secondary authorship, graduate work, book sections, conference papers, and non-refereed papers.
Trend analysis identifies and outlines the development of the field of study... for example...


The publication of this paper led to:
+ 100 citations in international journals
+ 4 international journal articles
+ 1 book chapter

www.StevenAndrewMartin.com
Example – Set the methods or criteria

- An analysis of the only known scholarly bibliography.
- A survey of the Thailand’s national journal index (TCI).
- Thai library system databases.
- Academic databases, including ResearchGate and Google Scholar.
- Major book publishers and retailers in Thailand, explored through searching books in print, websites, and enquiring at retail outlets.
- Communications and collaborations with international researchers and academics.
  - Participation at international scientific conferences.
- Personal interactions with Thai and international students and faculty members while instructing courses in Thai geography.
Categories of literature as a research outcome

“Research in its own right” – A qualitative result

- Grey literature and websites.
- Reports from governments and not-for-profit environmental organizations.
- Physical geography literature (including geomorphology and geology).
- Social science literature (including human, cultural, social, economic, political and historical geographies).
- Regional geography resources.
- Tourism geography, ecotourism and geotourism literature.
Sources of literature as a research outcome – Example of quantitative results

Based on these results, where might we consider submitting our research for publication?

**Table 1. International journals with 3 or more Thai geography publications.**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Journal</th>
<th>Thai geography publications</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Journal of the Siam Society</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Malaysian Journal of Tropical Geography</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal of Tropical Geography</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Singapore Journal of Tropical Geography</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geographical Journal</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geographical Magazine</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geographical Review</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annals of Tourism Research</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal of Geography</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Journal of Biogeography</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>71</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Notes: *Based on publications listed in Rumney (2010). **This journal is not currently active. ***An antecedent of the Singapore Journal of Tropical Geography.
The systematic review is foundational – a "silver bullet" – to conducting, writing and publishing scientific research papers.
Conclusion: Benefits of a Systematic Review

- **Desk research** (i.e. field research is not required).
- **Highly publishable** as a research in it’s own right.
- **Highly citable** once published.
- Serves as a “super literature review” for future articles.
- **Mastery of the literature** and subject area (long-term benefits).
- **Familiarity with scholars** in the field of study.
- Identification of **knowledge gaps**, hence justification of future research areas.
- Results in a **database of authors, files**, references for future works.
- Can lead to future **trend and meta-analyses**.
- Can identify **avenues for publication** of your research.
Conclusion: Suggestions and Opportunities

• Opportunity to create a complete and formative (first-ever?) body of tourism research literature.
  • A research publishable in its own right.
  • A research compiled specifically for current analysis.
  • A research compiled for future inquiry.

• Integration of your research into teaching and learning.

• Mastery of your field of study or research area.
  • Knowledge of topics, methods and scholars in a given field of study or topic area.

“Corpus”
Relevant Personal Resources from Today’s Talk

• Personal Website
  • https://www.stevenandrewmartin.com/

• Searching and Referencing
  • https://www.stevenandrewmartin.com/searching-and-referencing/

• Surf Tourism Research
  • https://www.stevenandrewmartin.com/surf-tourism-research/

• Thai Geography
  • https://www.stevenandrewmartin.com/thai-geography/

• List of Publications
  • https://www.stevenandrewmartin.com/publications/
Thank you

Asst Prof Steven A Martin, PhD
www.StevenAndrewMartin.com
Teaching and Research